

(altruism,)

.1)

()

가

가

?

.2)

가

가

60

(G. C. Williams, 1966)

. 70

1) "...

가

가

가

가

."(Wilson 1975b, 30)

2) (N. Sesardic)

'[]

'(Sesardic 1995, 128)

:

$$= \begin{pmatrix} \\ \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} \\ \end{pmatrix} + \begin{pmatrix} \\ \end{pmatrix} =$$

가 ,

2.

가

(etiological)

(Rosenberg 1992, 20).

가
)가

(,

)

()

.3)

3)

A []

= A

A

= A

가 (Sesardic 1995,

129).

Rosenberg)가 , (A. , (가) , (Rosenberg 1992, 20). (E. Sober) (“vernacular altruism”) “(intrinsic property)” , (Sober 1998, 460).

< 1>

	가 + ()	가 + ()
	(,)	()
	()	+ =
	() 가	() 가 = () 가 + 가
	()	

, 가 ()가 ,

가 가

가 ()
 (J. Wilson 2002,
 Rosas 2002).

가 가
 () 가
 가 (2003).

< 2> 3가

	+	+	+
	()	()	-
			¹ + 2 가
	가	(가)	가
	() 가 >	가 = 가	(-) (+) > 0

* '2

()
 가

가 ,

, 가

가 ,

가

“ -

(self-interested economic transaction)”

(Wilson & Dugatkin 1992, 32).

(optimize) ,

.4) ,

.5)

, 가 “

” . (

“

” 가 .)

4) “

” (Trivers 1978, 213). “

가 ; -

(enlightened self-interest) ” (Singer 1981, 42). (

Sesardic 1995)

5) “ (other regard behavior)”

(cooperation)

,

가 (Willson & Dugatkin 1992).

가

가 , 가
?

3.

(1998) 가 . 가
.6)

가 가 “ ” 가

“ (selective force)
(가)

6) , 6 160% 가 (Wilson & Sober, 1998, 121-132).

(Kerr & Godfrey-Smith 2002)
(individualistic)

가

가

가

가

?

가

가

(impasse)

(1998)

가

1)

2)

가

가

가

가?

가

?

가

? “ ” “ ”

가

가

가 가

가

()

가

가

가 가

가

가

가

4.

가?

가 .” (Sober 2000, 7.5).

가 가 (Sober 1998)가 “ (evolutionary spin-off)”

, “ ” 가 , 가 , 가

가 (Singer 1981, ch. 4)

가 , 가 ,

(Cavali-Sforza & Feldman 1981), (Boyd & Richerson 1985)

가 (Sober 2000, 7.5):

()

가 가

19

()

가

가

가

가

?

가

가

가

가

가

가

가

가

(Sober 2000, 7.5).

가

가 가

가

,

가

- (1998), 「*문화의 진화*」, 『*문화*』 54 (): 219-257.
- _____(2003), 「*문화의 진화*」, 『2003』: 184-202.
- (2004), 「*문화의 진화*」, 『*문화*』 64 (): 179-198
- Boyd, R. & Richerson, P.(1985), *Culture and The Evolution Process* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press).
- Cavali-Sforza, L and Feldman, M.(1981), *Cultural Transmission and Evolution: A Quantitative Approach* (Princeton: Princeton University Press).
- Gould, S. J.(1982), "The Meaning of Punctuated Equilibrium and its Role in Validation a Hierarchical Approach to Macroevolution", in R. Milkman (ed.), *Perspectives on Evolution*, (Sunderland, Mass,: Sinauer), 83-104.
- Kerr, B and Godfrey-Smith, P.(2002): "Individualist and Multi-level Perspectives on Selection in Structured Populations", *Biology and Philosophy* 17: 477-517.
- Parfit, D.(1984), *Reason and Persons*, New York: Oxford University Press.
- Rosas, A.(2002), "Psychological and Evolutionary Evidence for Altruism", *Biology and Philosophy* 17: 93-107.
- Rosenberg, A.(1992), "Altruism: Theoretical Contexts", in E. F. Keller and E. A.
- Sesardic, N.(1995), "Recent Work on Human Altruism and Evolution", *Ethics* 106: 128-157.
- Singer, P.(1981), *The Expanding Circle* (New York: Farrar, Straus, and Giroux).

- Sober, E.(1998), "What is Evolutionary Altruism?" in D. Hull and M. Ruse(eds.), *The Philosophy of Biology*, Oxford University Press, pp. 459-478.
- _____.(2000), *The Philosophy of Biology* (2nd Ed.), Westview Press.
- Sober, E. & Wilson, D.S.(1994), "Critical Review of Philosophical Works on the Units of Selection Problem", *Philosophy of Science* 61: 534-55.
- Wuketits, F. M.(1990), 『*Evolutionary Biology*』, 東京, 丸善.
- Williams, G. C.(1966), *Adaption and Natural Selection*, Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Trivers, R. L.(1971), "The Evolution of Reciprocal Altruism", *Quarterly Review of Biology* 46: 35-57.
- Wilson, D. S.(1998), "On the Relation between Evolutionary and Psychological Definition of Altruism and Selfishness", in Hull and Ruse(1998).
- Wilson, D. S. and Dugatkin, L. A.(1992), "Altruism: Contemporary Debates", in Keller and Loyd 1992.
- Wilson, E. O.(1975a), *Sociobiology: The New Synthesis*, Cambridge, Nass. - London.
- _____(1975b), 『*Sociobiology*』, 東京, 丸善, (:)
- Wilson, J.(2002), "The Accidental Altruist", *Biology and Philosophy* 17: 71-91.

DISCUSSION ABSTRACTS

A Swamp of Fitness: Some Questions about Professor
Jong-Duck Choi's "The Possibility of Biological Altruism"

Sang-Mo Jung

'Biological altruism' is an obscure concept in several ways. In this comment paper, first, I reveal the obscurity through analysing the concept 'altruism' shown in Professor Choi's paper. Second, I criticize his view that only Sober and Wilson's multi-level selection theory can plausibly solve the paradox of altruism. Third, I introduce the "evolutionary spin-off" theory and the "cultural evolution" theory as plausible alternatives to the multi-level selection theory.

[Key Words] altruism, fitness, group selection, multi-level selection theory